



**THE STATES assembled on Monday  
22nd September 2014, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Sir Michael Birt.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
General Sir John McColl, K.C.B., C.B.E., D.S.O.  
was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – absent on States business (arrived in the Chamber at 3.20 p.m.)  
Connétable John Edward Le Maistre of Grouville – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 9.49 a.m.)  
Deputy James Patrick Gorton Baker of St. Helier – ill

---

Prayers read by the Greffier of the States

---

**Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Road Traffic (St. Saviour) (Amendment No. 8) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.153/2014.
Community Provisions (Restrictive Measures – Russia) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for External Relations.</i>	R&O.154/2014.
Community Provisions (Restrictive Measures – Ukraine) (Amendment No. 10) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for External Relations.</i>	R&O.155/2014.
Medical Practitioners (Registration) (General Provisions) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.156/2014.
Medical Practitioners (Registration) (Responsible Officers) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.157/2014.
Financial Services Ombudsman (Exempt Business) (Jersey) Order 2014. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	R&O.158/2014.

**Documents presented or laid**

Freedom For Life Ministries: grant from Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (P.123/2014) – comments. Presented: 19th September 2014. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	P.123/2014. Com.
--	---------------------

Freedom For Life Ministries: grant from Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (P.123/2014) – comments. P.123/2014.  
Com.(2)  
Presented: 22nd September 2014.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

Draft Budget Statement 2015 (P.129/2014): fifth amendment (P.129/2014 Amd.(5)) – P.129/2014.  
Amd.(5)Com.  
comments.  
Presented: 19th September 2014.  
*Public Accounts Committee.*

Sex Discrimination Consultation: summary of responses. R.137/2014.  
Presented: 19th September 2014.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

Scrutiny and Public Accounts Committee Legacy Report: November 2011 – R.138/2014.  
November 2014.  
Presented: 22nd September 2014.  
*Chairmen’s Committee.*

Trackers Apprentice Programme (S.R.8/2014): response of the Minister for S.R.8/2014.  
Education, Sport and Culture. Res.  
Presented: 19th September 2014.  
*Minister for Education, Sport and Culture.*

Draft 2015 Budget (S.R.12/2014) –response of the Minister for Treasury and S.R.12/2014.  
Resources. Res.(2)  
Presented: 22nd September 2014.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

Health and Social Services Integrated Care Records Programme (P.A.C.2/2014): P.A.C.2/2014.  
response of Departments. Res.  
Presented: 19th September 2014.  
*Public Accounts Committee.*

### **Notification of lodged propositions**

Draft Pet Travel Scheme (Amendment) (Jersey) Regulations 201-. P.150/2014.  
Lodged: 22nd September 2014.  
*Minister for Planning and Environment.*

Draft Financial Services Commission (Amendment No. 6) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.151/2014.  
Lodged: 22nd September 2014.  
*Chief Minister.*

Draft Financial Services Ombudsman (Jersey) Law 2014 (Appointed Day) Act 201-. P.152/2014.  
Lodged: 22nd September 2014.  
*Minister for Economic Development.*

**Written Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator A. Breckon regarding Dwelling Houses Loan Fund withdrawals in each of the last 10 years.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator A. Breckon regarding when presentations were made to potential investors regarding the issue of a £250 million bond.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy S.S.P.A. Power of St. Brelade regarding waste disposal charges applied to all third sector charities.

The Minister for Planning and Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy S.S.P.A. Power of St. Brelade regarding charges for planning applications for all third sector charities.

The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy S.S.P.A. Power of St. Brelade regarding the promotion of the employment of older local residents.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement regarding speed limits across the Island.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement regarding sea defences and the monitoring of sea levels.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement regarding the drainage works at Snow Hill.

The Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement regarding the publication of members' attendance levels.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. John regarding clinical waiting times.

The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence regarding the significant reduction in the income forecasts compared to those included in the Medium Term Financial Plan.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence regarding when States members were informed of the significant reduction in income forecasts.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade regarding the substantial increase in the budget forecast in States income in 2016 and 2017 compared with the latest forecast for 2014.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade regarding the reliability of the financial forecasts.

**Oral Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Connétable of St. Mary asked a question of the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee regarding communication with those making complaints under the States Members' Code of Conduct.

Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the prosecution of cyber-bullies.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Deputy Chief Minister regarding the extension of the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 to agencies such as Andium Homes.

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the use of the rental income from States' tenants.

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the actual income position compared to the figures included in the Budget.

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the variances reported by the States Income Monitoring reports for July and August 2014.

The Connétable of St. John asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding hospital waiting times to see specialists in all departments.

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding whether the States had a structural deficit.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding measures to reduce the cost of G.P. services to residents.

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains of St. Clement asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the standard of treatment which stroke patients received at Overdale.

**Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for External Relations answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for Home Affairs answered questions without notice from members.

**Draft Budget Statement 2015 P.129/2014**

THE STATES commenced consideration of the Draft Budget Statement 2015 (P.129/2014) and, adopting a proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 80A(4)(b) that the lodging period in respect of the amendments which he had lodged to the 'Draft Budget Statement 2015' (P.129/2014) could be reduced to allow their consideration at the present meeting.

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources, agreed that he could propose the Budget ‘as amended’ by the 2 sets of amendments he had lodged (P.129/2014 Amd.(4) and Amd.(5)), that in paragraph (b) after the words “Summary Table D” there should be inserted the words “(with the removal of the item “JDE Development and Upgrade – £1,238,000)””, and for the amount “£76,382,000” there should be substituted the amount “£75,144,000”; that in paragraph (h) for the amount “£2,000,000” there should be substituted the amount “£6,500,000”, and that after paragraph (b) there should be inserted a new paragraph as follows and the remaining paragraphs renumbered accordingly –

- “(c) to approve, in accordance with the provisions of Regulation 22(1)(c) of the Public Finances (Transitional Provisions) (No. 2) (Jersey) Regulations 2005 the transfer in 2014 of £2,635,000 from the Car Parks Trading Fund to the consolidated fund, with £635,000 of this sum being used to fund the “Road Safety Improvements” 2015 capital project of the Transport and Technical Services Department, £500,000 being used to fund part of the Department’s “Infrastructure rolling vote” in 2015 for sustainable transport initiatives and £1,500,000 being used to offset the cost of the existing Green Street Car Park capital project.”

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade to the ‘Draft Budget Statement 2015’ (P.129/2014) as amended and, adopting his own amendment to the amendment (P.129/2014 Amd.Amd.), agreed that after the words “paid by taxpayers” there should be inserted the words “paying tax at the marginal rate and who are”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade to the ‘Draft Budget Statement 2015’ (P.129/2014) as amended and, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Treasury and Resources (P.129/2014 Amd.(2)Amd.), agreed that for the words “over the age of 55” there should be substituted the words “over the age of 67”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 29**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**CONTRE: 17**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy N.B. Le Cornu (H)

**ABSTAIN: 2**

Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

THE STATES rejected the amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade to the ‘Draft Budget Statement 2015’ as amended (P.129/2014 Amd.Amd.), that in paragraph (a) after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

“except that health insurance premiums paid by taxpayers paying tax at the marginal rate and who are over the age of 67 shall qualify for relief from income tax with effect from the year of assessment 2015;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 15**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

**CONTRE: 34**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy N.B. Le Cornu (H)

THE STATES, in accordance with Standing Order 80A(4)(b), approved the request of the Minister for Treasury and Resources that the lodging period in respect of the amendment which he had lodged to the 'Draft Budget Statement 2015' (P.129/2014 Amd.(6)) could be reduced to allow its consideration at the present meeting.

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade (P.129/2014 Amd.(3)), that in paragraph (a), after the words "as set out in the Budget Statement" there should be inserted the words –

“except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2015 shall be reduced by £3,400,000 by exempting or zero-rating domestic energy from Goods and Services Tax from 1st January 2015.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

Senator A. Breckon  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)  
Deputy N.B. Le Cornu (H)  
Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)

**CONTRE: 39**

Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Senator I.J. Gorst  
Senator L.J. Farnham  
Senator P.M. Bailhache  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of Grouville  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
Deputy of St. Peter

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade (P.129/2014 Amd.(2)) and, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Treasury and Resources (P.129/2014 Amd.(2)Amd.), agreed that for the sum “£277,000” there should be substituted the sum “£115,000”, after the words “for the year 2015” there should be deleted the words “the current”, and for the words “and not removing this concession on 1st January 2015” there should be substituted the words “by introducing a relief which reduces the rates of stamp duty or land transaction tax as set out in the Appendix on properties bought by first time buyers worth between £400,000 and £450,000.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 32**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy N.B. Le Cornu (H)

**CONTRE: 9**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade (P.129/2014 Amd.(2)) as amended, agreed that after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –



“except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2015 shall be reduced by £115,000 by maintaining for the year 2015 reduced rates of stamp duty and land transaction tax for first-time buyers on properties up to a value of £450,000 and by introducing a relief which reduces the rates of stamp duty or land transaction tax as set out in the Appendix on properties bought by first time buyers worth between £400,000 and £450,000;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 42**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

**CONTRE: 2**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Deputy of St. Martin

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy M. Tadier (B)

**Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade (P.129/2014 Amd.(3)) and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, O.B.E., Greffier of the States, until his return.

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Tuesday 23rd September 2014 to continue consideration of the Draft Budget Statement 2015 (P.129/2014) as amended and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.20 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE, O.B.E.**

*Greffier of the States*